

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 7th June, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: D. Dovey, D. Edwards, D. Evans, R. Harris,
B. Hayward, P. Murphy, M. Powell, A. Webb and A. Wintle

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Mark Hand	Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Paula Clarke	Planning Applications and Enforcement Manager
Robert Tranter	Head of Legal Services & Monitoring Officer
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

APOLOGIES:

Councillors D. Blakebrough and J. Higginson

1. Election of Chairman.

We elected County Councillor R. Edwards as Chair.

2. Appointment of Vice-Chairman.

We appointed County Councillor P.R. Clarke as Vice-Chair.

3. Declarations of Interest.

There were no declarations of Interest made by Members.

4. Confirmation of minutes.

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 3rd May 2016 were confirmed and signed by the Chairman subject to the following amendments:

Minute 1 – Declarations of Interest:

Remove County Councillor V. Smith's declaration of interest and replace with the following:

County Councillor A. Webb declared a personal interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of Planning Application DC/2015/01291, as she is a Board Member of Monmouthshire Housing Association.

Minute 4 – Planning Application DC/2015/01431:

The following additional wording be added:

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 7th June, 2016 at 2.00 pm

The Planning Committee was mindful of the flood risk objections raised by officers and Natural Resources Wales, but considered that, provided the modelling confirms that off-site flood risk is not made worse by the proposed development, this objection was outweighed by the considerable economic and tourism benefits of the proposed hotel, and the proposals relating to the flood management plan. In weighing the planning balance, Committee Members were mindful of the concern regarding the depth of flood water on the access road, but considered that this was not materially different to the current fallback position from the use of the site for industrial or employment purposes.

5. PLANNING APPLICATION DC/2015/00133 - FOUR NEW RETIREMENT BUNGALOWS. LAND TO REAR OF KYALAMI, MERTHYR ROAD, LLANFOIST.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

Having received the report the following points were noted:

- In response to a Member's question regarding access, it was noted that the retaining wall has planning permission as an engineering works. It is aimed to safely retain the land between the two sites and that it be fit for purpose. The levels between the two sites should knit together safely.
- A Member expressed concern that the site might be too steep for elderly residents.
- The site had ample space to accommodate three parking spaces per household but this had been relaxed.
- In response to a Member's question regarding the condition that the properties were to be occupied by residents aged 50 and over, it was noted that this condition could be deleted if Members did not consider it to be necessary in planning terms.
- The road will be wide enough to accommodate emergency vehicles. There were no concerns regarding drainage at the site.

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor D. Edwards and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2015/00133 be approved subject to the conditions, as outlined in the report but with the removal of condition three – that the dwellings be occupied by persons aged 50 and over. An additional condition to be added to ensure levels and sections through the access are submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority to ensure the edge of the site knits together with the adjoining land where retaining works have taken place.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	10
Against approval	-	0

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 7th June, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

Abstentions - 1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/00133 be approved subject to the conditions, as outlined in the report but with the removal of condition three – that the dwellings be occupied by persons aged 50 and over. Members did not consider that the restriction was necessary to make the development acceptable in planning terms and that occupation of the bungalows by younger persons would be acceptable. An additional condition to be added to ensure levels and sections through the access are submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority to ensure the edge of the site knits together with the adjoining land where retaining works have taken place.

6. PLANNING APPLICATION DC/2015/01112 - CHANGE OF USE OF EXISTING PUBLIC HOUSE TO TWO RESIDENTIAL DWELLINGS INCLUDING AN EXTENSION. MOON AND SIXPENCE, MAIN ROAD, TINTERN.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the seven conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for St. Arvans, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed her support for the application.

The Planning Committee considered that approval of this application would help towards improving highway safety at this location.

It was proposed by County Councillor Webb and seconded by County Councillor Evans that application DC/2015/01112 be approved subject to the seven conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recoded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01112 be approved subject to the seven conditions, as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 7th June, 2016 at 2.00 pm

7. PLANNING APPLICATION DC/2015/01184 - RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT TO PROVIDE 212 DWELLINGS INCLUDING 20 AFFORDABLE UNITS, RECONFIGURED ACCESS, A NEW EMERGENCY ROUTE, NEW INTERNAL ROADS, FOOTPATHS/CYCLE WAYS, CAR PARKING AND HIGHWAY IMPROVEMENTS, A NETWORK OF PUBLIC OPEN SPACE INCLUDING LANDSCAPE AND RECREATIONAL SPACE, PUBLIC REALM AND BIODIVERSITY ENHANCEMENTS, OTHER ANCILLARY WORKS, RE-PROFILING OF THE LAND AND THE INSTALLATION OF NEW SERVICES AND INFRASTRUCTURE. SADBROOK PAPERMILL, SADBROOK.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 25 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Agreement, as outlined in the report.

In considering the detail of the application, it was noted that there would be 20 affordable housing units (9.4%) and 192 market houses. Officers were expecting the number of affordable houses to be greater than the 20 proposed. The District Valuer was brought in to arbitrate in the dispute over appropriate affordable housing numbers for the site. The District Valuer's findings indicated that the scheme could only afford in viability terms the 20 affordable homes (9.4%). As this is an independent valuation, this makes the scheme policy compliant. The S106 agreement will include a viability review clause allowing viability to be reassessed should the site not come forward promptly. This was recommended by the District Valuer.

Having received the report, the following points were noted:

- The development will start in 2018 and is anticipated to finish in 2024, which falls outside of the Local Development Plan (LDP) period. A member expressed concern that the larger strategic sites might not be finished during the LDP period. The Head of Planning stated that most of the larger strategic sites would be verging towards the end of the LDP period because the LDP period is short. It was noted that sites have not come forward as quickly as anticipated. This scheme is the first of the larger strategic schemes and it has been acknowledged that it has taken time to get to this stage of the process.
- A member expressed concern that the developer was not providing enough affordable housing. It was reiterated that independent evidence had indicated that the developer could only provide 20 affordable homes for this site.
- The site is located on the edge of the coast with the likelihood that the properties would be subject to extreme weathering.
- In response to a Members question the Head of Planning stated that he could liaise with the Highways department to discuss the feasibility of providing bollards on the pavement to deter on street parking.

Having received the report and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor D. Evans and seconded by County Councillor A. Webb that application

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 7th June, 2016 at 2.00 pm

DC/2015/01184 be approved subject to the 25 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Agreement, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	10
Against approval	-	1
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01184 be approved subject to the 25 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Agreement, as outlined in the report.

8. PLANNING APPLICATION DC/2015/01528 - ERECTION OF A DETACHED DWELLING. GLEN USK, MAIN ROAD, UNDY.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions as outlined in the report.

The application had been presented to Planning Committee on the 12th April 2016 where the Committee had resolved to defer the application so that amendments could be made to the positioning of the dwelling within the site and to the design of the dwelling. It had been requested to:

- Move the dwelling south-west of the site towards the neighbouring property Fairfield Court.
- Move the position of the dwelling south eastwards (towards the rear) so that it was not directly positioned behind no. 8 Rectory Gardens and so that the dwelling was mainly positioned between the building line of no. 8 and no. 7 Rectory Gardens.
- Change the roof material from a slate to a roof tile to match adjoining dwellings.
- Clarify the colour of the proposed render.

Following this request, amended plans had been submitted illustrating the changes.

Having received the report, it was proposed by County Councillor D. Evans and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DC/2015/01528 be approved subject to the amendments to the site, as outlined in the report

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 7th June, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that that application DC/2015/01528 be approved subject to the amendments to the site, as outlined in the report.

9. PLANNING APPLICATION DC/2016/00141 - TO BUILD TWO DETACHED HOUSES RATHER THAN A PAIR OF SEMI-DETACHED HOUSES, APPROVED ON 8 AUGUST 2008 UNDER PLANNING PERMISSION REF. DC/2007/01569. 17 DIXTON CLOSE, MONMOUTH.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

County Councillor R.J.C. Hayward declared that he had a closed mind in respect of this planning application following a telephone conversation with the applicant. He therefore left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

In noting the detail of the application, some Members had noted that an application had already been approved on 8th August 2008 to build a pair of semi-detached houses on this site and therefore considered that the application to build two detached houses on the site should not be approved.

Other Members considered that the application complied with planning regulations and there were no reasons to refuse the application.

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2015/000141 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	7
Against approval	-	2
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/000141 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

10. PLANNING APPLICATION DC/2016/00342 - CHANGE OF USE OF A1 RETAIL USE TO C3 DWELLING TO INCLUDE RECONSTRUCTION OF BUILDING. OLD FORGE CRAFT SHOP, LLANELLEN LINK, LLANELLEN.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor P.R. Clarke that application DC/2016/00342 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 7th June, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00342 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

11. PLANNING APPLICATION DC/2016/00378 - RETENTION OF REDWOOD SCULPTURES OF THE DRAGON AND LEOPARD FROM THE BEAUFORT COAT OF ARMS. THE BEAUFORT ARMS HOTEL, HIGH STREET, RAGLAN.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the one condition, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, the Committee considered the sculptures to be good examples of local art. However, concern was expressed that the location of the proposed sculptures needed to be reviewed.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor P.R. Clarke that consideration of application DC/2016/00378 be deferred to allow officers to investigate with the applicant an alternative location for the sculptures and that if accepted, the Delegation Panel should approve the alternative location.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For deferral	-	11
Against deferral	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that consideration of application DC/2016/00378 be deferred to allow officers to investigate with the applicant an alternative location for the sculptures and that if accepted, the Delegation Panel should approve the alternative location.

12. Proposed Amendments to the Protocol on Public Speaking at Planning Committee.

We considered the revised Protocol on Public Speaking at Planning Committee.

We resolved to endorse the revised Protocol on Public Speaking at Planning Committee for adoption by Single Cabinet Member.

The meeting ended at 4.02 pm